Session IV: Proposal evaluation in European research programs

Panel discussion moderated by
• Barbara Abraham, IST Austria, Head of Grant Office

with the participation of:
• Ana ALMANSA-MARTIN, IST Austria, Evaluator of European cooperative projects
• Nick BARTON, IST Austria, ERC Panel member
• Franz KERSCHBAUM, Institute of Astronomy, University of Vienna, MSC Fellowship Evaluator
The evaluation procedure in practice:
Standard H2020 evaluation process

- Eligible proposals are allocated to evaluators
- Individual evaluation
- Consensus group
- Panel review
- Final ranked list is finalised


- In the case of 2 stages proposals, the process is repeated two times
- Special case: FET-Open evaluation (not the usual consensus procedure)
The evaluation procedure in practice: Frontier research projects

Before the 1st step begins, eligible proposals are allocated to the panels

Individual assessment by panel members and remote referees

Individual Evaluation Reports (may be done remotely)

Panel assessment

Panel ranked list

Invitation to Step 2 evaluation (step 1) or Recommendation for funding (step 2)

Based on the information in „ERC Rules for Submission & Evaluation“

- Usually done in a *single submission, two-step* evaluation process:
  - **Step 1** - Evaluation of extended synopsis (plus CV and track record)
  - **Step 2** - Evaluation of full proposal (including an interview)
What is actually evaluated?

- Peer review of Frontier Research Projects (ERC proposals):
  - Ground-breaking nature, ambition and feasibility of the research project
  - Intellectual capability and creativity of the applicant (as well as commitment)

- For all others, three main criteria:
  - Excellence
  - Impact
  - Implementation

… but weight, thresholds and sub-criteria differ from one to other type of project!
But who are the evaluators?

- They are „external“ (do not belong to EC, but are selected by EC staff).
- They are „independent“ (and should not have any conflict of interest)
- They are „experts“, with background in different fields
  - Scientists, industrialists, project and program managers, professors, innovation consultants, company owners....

.... but above all they are human, with diverse opinions, personalities and attitudes